UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20460

OFFICE OF
ENFORCEMENT AND
COMPLIANCE ASSURANCE

VIA CERTIFIED MAIL
RETURN RECEIPT REQUESTED

VIA EMAIL to delmer.wood@shell.com

NOV 07 2011

Shell Oil Products US
Attention: Lisa Davis, Responsible Corporate Officer
700 Milam Street
PNT-27002
Houston, TX 77002

Re: Notice of Violation of Renewable Fuel Standards
File Number AED/MSEB # 7972

Dear Lisa Davis:

The Environmental Protection Agency (EPA or we) has commenced an investigation into Shell Oil Products US (Shell Oil Products or you) regarding whether you used invalid Renewable Identification Numbers (RINs) to meet your 2010 Renewable Volume Obligation (RVO) under the Clean Air Act (CAA). Based on the information available to the EPA as a result of this investigation, we have determined that Clean Green Fuels, LLC (Clean Green Fuels) created invalid RINs, and that Shell Oil Products used some of the RINs created by Clean Green Fuels in an effort to satisfy your 2010 RVO. Use of invalid RINs to satisfy RVOs is a violation of the EPA's regulations governing RINs and renewable fuels. 40 C.F.R. § 80.1460(c).

Section 211(o) of the CAA originally was enacted as part of the Energy Policy Act of 2005 (EPAct), and was amended by the Energy Information and Security Act of 2007 (EISA). The EPA promulgated the original renewable fuels standards regulations (RFS 1) at 40 C.F.R. Part 80, Subpart K to implement EPAct, and subsequently promulgated the current renewable fuels standards regulations (RFS 2) at 40 C.F.R. Part 80, Subpart M to implement EISA. EPAct set the first national renewable fuel mandate in the United States, and required 7.5 billion gallons of renewable fuel to be blended into gasoline by 2012. EISA required the EPA to make several important changes to the original renewable fuels regulations, including increasing the volume of renewable fuel required to be blended into transportation fuel to 36 billion gallons per year by 2022. EISA and the RFS 2 regulations also established new categories of renewable fuel with separate volume requirements, and set new greenhouse gas (GHG) emission reduction thresholds for each separate category of renewable fuel. The RFS 2 regulations lay the foundation to achieve significant reductions of GHG

emissions from the use of renewable fuels, reduce petroleum importation, and encourage the development and expansion of our nation's renewable fuels sector.

The RFS 2 regulations require petroleum refiners and importers (referred to as "obligated parties"), and exporters of renewable fuel to acquire sufficient RINs to demonstrate compliance with their RVOs. The regulations include a credit trading program to facilitate compliance with the renewable fuel standards. The credit trading program allows obligated parties and exporters of renewable fuel to comply with their RVOs through the purchase of RINs.

The RFS 2 regulations provide that no person shall use invalid RINs to meet their RVO, regardless of that person's good faith belief that the RINs were valid at the time they were acquired. 40 C.F.R. §§ 80.1431(b)(2), 80.1460(c)(1). RINs that do not represent renewable fuel are invalid. 40 C.F.R. § 80.1431(a)(1)(vi).

Based on available information, the EPA has determined that Shell Oil Products used the 1,136,250 invalid RINs identified in Attachment A to meet your 2010 RVO. These RINs are invalid because they do not represent renewable fuel. The company that generated these RINs, Clean Green Fuels, neither produced nor imported any biodiesel as necessary to legally generate these RINs. This determination is based upon the EPA's inspection of the purported production facility and subsequent investigation.

As noted above and detailed in 40 C.F.R. § 80.1431(b), invalid RINs cannot be used for compliance. In view of the EPA's determination that Clean Green Fuels RINs are invalid, any RINs generated by Clean Green Fuels must be removed from your 2010 annual compliance report and a corrected report must be resubmitted. The resubmitted report must include only valid RINs. We request that you make these adjustments and resubmit your annual compliance report within 14 business days after your receipt of this Notice of Violation (NOV). You may contact the EPA Fuels Help Line at (202) 343-9755 if you have questions regarding these reports, including how to make adjustments.

The EPA issues this NOV under Sections 205 and 211 of the CAA, 42 U.S.C. §§ 7524 and 7545, for the violations described above. Sections 205 and 211 of the CAA authorize the EPA to assess a civil penalty of up to $37,500 for every day for each violation, plus the economic benefit or savings resulting from each violation. 42 U.S.C. §§ 7524, 7545(d); *see also* 40 C.F.R. §§ 19.4, 80.1461, 80.1463. In determining an appropriate penalty for violations, the EPA considers the gravity of the violation, the economic benefit or savings (if any) resulting from the violation, the size of your business, your history of compliance with the CAA, actions taken by you to remedy the violation and prevent future violations, the effect of the penalty on your ability to continue in business, and other matters as justice may require. 42 U.S.C. § 7524. This NOV does not create any rights or waive any of your obligations under the CAA, but rather is for the purpose of notifying you of the violations.

We are offering you an opportunity to confer with us about the violations alleged in this NOV. The conference will give you an opportunity to present information on the alleged violations, any efforts you have taken to comply, and the steps you will take to prevent future violations.

The EPA attorney assigned to this matter is Evan M. Belser. He can be reached at (202) 564-6850, Belser.Evan@epa.gov, or at the following address:

Evan M. Belser, Attorney Adviser
EPA, Air Enforcement Division
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Ariel Rios South Building Room 1111A, Mailcode 2242A
Washington, D.C. 20460 (20004 for non-USPS couriers)

Contact Mr. Belser to request the conference described above. Any conference should be held within 60 calendar days of your receipt of this NOV. By offering the opportunity for a conference, or participating in one, the EPA does not waive or limit its right to any remedy available under the CAA.

We appreciate your attention to this important matter and look forward to working with you to reach a resolution.

Sincerely,

Matthew W. Morrison

for Phillip A. Brooks
Director
Air Enforcement Division

cc: Matthew W. Morrison, Associate Director, Air Enforcement Division
Jacqueline Robles Werner, Chief, Mobile Source Enforcement Branch
Jeffrey A. Kodish, Fuels Team Leader, Mobile Source Enforcement Branch

Attachment A
Notice of Violation of Renewable Fuel Standards, File Number AED/MSEB # 7972

List of Invalid Renewable Identification Numbers Shell Oil Products US
Retired for Compliance Purposes

2201034608400003370152000104460001125 0
2201034608400004004152000000100001751
2201034608400002511152000772900009750
2201034608400001529152000760600009750
2201034608400002281152000000100002978
2201034608400002200152000000100006000
2201034608400002201152000000100006000
2201034608400002216152000000100006000
2201034608400002217152000000100006000
2201034608400002221152000000100006000
2201034608400002222152000000100006000
2201034608400002236152000000100006000
2201034608400002237152000000100006000
2201034608400002261152000000100006000
2201034608400002270152000000100006000
2201034608400002271152000000100006000
2201034608400001533152000000100006000
2201034608400001534152000000100006000
2201034608400001558152000000100006000
2201034608400002259152000000100006750
2201034608400002260152000000100006750
2201034608400001556152000000100006750
2201034608400001557152000000100006750
2201034608400002206152000000100007500
2201034608400002207152000000100007500
2201034608400002208152000000100007500
2201034608400002215152000000100007500
2201034608400002227152000000100007500
2201034608400002228152000000100007500
2201034608400002229152000000100007500
2201034608400002235152000000100007500
2201034608400002242152000000100007500
2201034608400002243152000000100007500
2201034608400002244152000000100007500
2201034608400002250152000000100007500
2201034608400002257152000000100007500
2201034608400002258152000000100007500
2201034608400002269152000000100007500
2201034608400002276152000000100007500
2201034608400002277152000000100007500
2201034608400002278152000000100007500
2201034608400002512152000000100007500
2201034608400001532152000000100007500
2201034608400001539152000000100007500
2201034608400001540152000000100007500
2201034608400001541152000000100007500
2201034608400001547152000000100007500
2201034608400001554152000000100007500
2201034608400001555152000000100007500
2201034608400003367152000000100007585
2201034608400002220152000000100008250
2201034608400002209152000000100009000
2201034608400002210152000000100009000
2201034608400002230152000000100009000
2201034608400002231152000000100009000
2201034608400002245152000000100009000
2201034608400002246152000000100009000
2201034608400002279152000000100009000
2201034608400002280152000000100009000
2201034608400001542152000000100009000
2201034608400001543152000000100009000
2201034608400002293152000000100009022
2201034608400002204152000000100009750
2201034608400002205152000000100009750
2201034608400002211152000000100009750
2201034608400002225152000000100009750
2201034608400002226152000000100009750
2201034608400002232152000000100009750
2201034608400002240152000000100009750
2201034608400002241152000000100009750
2201034608400002247152000000100009750
2201034608400002251152000000100009750
2201034608400002252152000000100009750
2201034608400002255152000000100009750
2201034608400002256152000000100009750
2201034608400002274152000000100009750
2201034608400002275152000000100009750
2201034608400001537152000000100009750
2201034608400001538152000000100009750
2201034608400001544152000000100009750
2201034608400001548152000000100009750
2201034608400001549152000000100009750
2201034608400001552152000000100009750
2201034608400001553152000000100009750
2201034608400002212152000000100010500
2201034608400002213152000000100010500

2201034608400002214152000000100010500
2201034608400002233152000000100010500
2201034608400002234152000000100010500
2201034608400002248152000000100010500
2201034608400002249152000000100010500
2201034608400002267152000000100010500
2201034608400002268152000000100010500
2201034608400001530152000000100010500
2201034608400001531152000000100010500
2201034608400001545152000000100010500
2201034608400001546152000000100010500
2201034608400002265152000000100011250
2201034608400002266152000000100011250
2201034608400001562152000000100011250
2201034608400002202152000000100012000
2201034608400002203152000000100012000
2201034608400002218152000000100012000
2201034608400002219152000000100012000
2201034608400002223152000000100012000
2201034608400002224152000000100012000
2201034608400002238152000000100012000
2201034608400002239152000000100012000
2201034608400002253152000000100012000
2201034608400002254152000000100012000
2201034608400002262152000000100012000
2201034608400002263152000000100012000
2201034608400002264152000000100012000
2201034608400002272152000000100012000
2201034608400002273152000000100012000
2201034608400001535152000000100012000
2201034608400001536152000000100012000
2201034608400001550152000000100012000
2201034608400001551152000000100012000
2201034608400001559152000000100012000
2201034608400001560152000000100012000
2201034608400001561152000000100012000
2201034608400003354152000000100012000
2201034608400003344152000000100012000